

Historic, Archive Document

Do not assume content reflects current scientific knowledge, policies, or practices.

ASD11
.A422

Quel/86

✓



United States
Department of
Agriculture

Forest
Pest
Management

TECHNICAL
REPORT R2-23

**GROUND
TRUTHING
MOUNTAIN PINE
BEETLE KILLED
PONDEROSA PINE**

1371A
1371B
1371C
1371D
1371E
1371F
1371G
1371H
1371I
1371J
1371K
1371L
1371M
1371N
1371O
1371P
1371Q
1371R
1371S
1371T
1371U
1371V
1371W
1371X
1371Y
1371Z
1371AA
1371AB
1371AC
1371AD
1371AE
1371AF
1371AG
1371AH
1371AI
1371AJ
1371AK
1371AL
1371AM
1371AN
1371AO
1371AP
1371AQ
1371AR
1371AS
1371AT
1371AU
1371AV
1371AW
1371AX
1371AY
1371AZ
1371BA
1371BB
1371BC
1371BD
1371BE
1371BF
1371BG
1371BH
1371BI
1371BJ
1371BK
1371BL
1371BM
1371BN
1371BO
1371BP
1371BQ
1371BR
1371BS
1371BT
1371BU
1371BV
1371BW
1371BX
1371BY
1371BZ
1371CA
1371CB
1371CC
1371CD
1371CE
1371CF
1371CG
1371CH
1371CI
1371CJ
1371CK
1371CL
1371CM
1371CN
1371CO
1371CP
1371CQ
1371CR
1371CS
1371CT
1371CU
1371CV
1371CW
1371CX
1371CY
1371CZ
1371DA
1371DB
1371DC
1371DD
1371DE
1371DF
1371DG
1371DH
1371DI
1371DJ
1371DK
1371DL
1371DM
1371DN
1371DO
1371DP
1371DQ
1371DR
1371DS
1371DT
1371DU
1371DV
1371DW
1371DX
1371DY
1371DZ
1371EA
1371EB
1371EC
1371ED
1371EE
1371EF
1371EG
1371EH
1371EI
1371EJ
1371EK
1371EL
1371EM
1371EN
1371EO
1371EP
1371EQ
1371ER
1371ES
1371ET
1371EU
1371EV
1371EW
1371EX
1371EY
1371EZ
1371FA
1371FB
1371FC
1371FD
1371FE
1371FF
1371FG
1371FH
1371FI
1371FJ
1371FK
1371FL
1371FM
1371FN
1371FO
1371FP
1371FQ
1371FR
1371FS
1371FT
1371FU
1371FV
1371FW
1371FX
1371FY
1371FZ
1371GA
1371GB
1371GC
1371GD
1371GE
1371GF
1371GG
1371GH
1371GI
1371GJ
1371GK
1371GL
1371GM
1371GN
1371GO
1371GP
1371GQ
1371GR
1371GS
1371GT
1371GU
1371GV
1371GW
1371GX
1371GY
1371GZ
1371HA
1371HB
1371HC
1371HD
1371HE
1371HF
1371HG
1371HH
1371HI
1371HJ
1371HK
1371HL
1371HM
1371HN
1371HO
1371HP
1371HQ
1371HR
1371HS
1371HT
1371HU
1371HV
1371HW
1371HX
1371HY
1371HZ
1371IA
1371IB
1371IC
1371ID
1371IE
1371IF
1371IG
1371IH
1371II
1371IJ
1371IK
1371IL
1371IM
1371IN
1371IO
1371IP
1371IQ
1371IR
1371IS
1371IT
1371IU
1371IV
1371IW
1371IX
1371IY
1371IZ
1371JA
1371JB
1371JC
1371JD
1371JE
1371JF
1371JG
1371JH
1371JI
1371JJ
1371JK
1371JL
1371JM
1371JN
1371JO
1371JP
1371JQ
1371JR
1371JS
1371JT
1371JU
1371JV
1371JW
1371JX
1371JY
1371JZ
1371KA
1371KB
1371KC
1371KD
1371KE
1371KF
1371KG
1371KH
1371KI
1371KJ
1371KK
1371KL
1371KM
1371KN
1371KO
1371KP
1371KQ
1371KR
1371KS
1371KT
1371KU
1371KV
1371KW
1371KX
1371KY
1371KZ
1371LA
1371LB
1371LC
1371LD
1371LE
1371LF
1371LG
1371LH
1371LI
1371LJ
1371LK
1371LL
1371LM
1371LN
1371LO
1371LP
1371LQ
1371LR
1371LS
1371LT
1371LU
1371LV
1371LW
1371LX
1371LY
1371LZ
1371MA
1371MB
1371MC
1371MD
1371ME
1371MF
1371MG
1371MH
1371MI
1371MJ
1371MK
1371ML
1371MM
1371MN
1371MO
1371MP
1371MQ
1371MR
1371MS
1371MT
1371MU
1371MV
1371MW
1371MX
1371MY
1371MZ
1371NA
1371NB
1371NC
1371ND
1371NE
1371NF
1371NG
1371NH
1371NI
1371NJ
1371NK
1371NL
1371NM
1371NN
1371NO
1371NP
1371NQ
1371NR
1371NS
1371NT
1371NU
1371NV
1371NW
1371NX
1371NY
1371NZ
1371OA
1371OB
1371OC
1371OD
1371OE
1371OF
1371OG
1371OH
1371OI
1371OJ
1371OK
1371OL
1371OM
1371ON
1371OO
1371OP
1371OQ
1371OR
1371OS
1371OT
1371OU
1371OV
1371OW
1371OX
1371OY
1371OZ
1371PA
1371PB
1371PC
1371PD
1371PE
1371PF
1371PG
1371PH
1371PI
1371PJ
1371PK
1371PL
1371PM
1371PN
1371PO
1371PP
1371PQ
1371PR
1371PS
1371PT
1371PU
1371PV
1371PW
1371PX
1371PY
1371PZ
1371QA
1371QB
1371QC
1371QD
1371QE
1371QF
1371QG
1371QH
1371QI
1371QJ
1371QK
1371QL
1371QM
1371QN
1371QO
1371QP
1371QQ
1371QR
1371QS
1371QT
1371QU
1371QV
1371QW
1371QX
1371QY
1371QZ
1371RA
1371RB
1371RC
1371RD
1371RE
1371RF
1371RG
1371RH
1371RI
1371RJ
1371RK
1371RL
1371RM
1371RN
1371RO
1371RP
1371RQ
1371RR
1371RS
1371RT
1371RU
1371RV
1371RW
1371RX
1371RY
1371RZ
1371SA
1371SB
1371SC
1371SD
1371SE
1371SF
1371SG
1371SH
1371SI
1371SJ
1371SK
1371SL
1371SM
1371SN
1371SO
1371SP
1371SQ
1371SR
1371SS
1371ST
1371SU
1371SV
1371SW
1371SX
1371SY
1371SZ
1371TA
1371TB
1371TC
1371TD
1371TE
1371TF
1371TG
1371TH
1371TI
1371TJ
1371TK
1371TL
1371TM
1371TN
1371TO
1371TP
1371TQ
1371TR
1371TS
1371TT
1371TU
1371TV
1371TW
1371TX
1371TY
1371TZ
1371UA
1371UB
1371UC
1371UD
1371UE
1371UF
1371UG
1371UH
1371UI
1371UJ
1371UK
1371UL
1371UM
1371UN
1371UO
1371UP
1371UQ
1371UR
1371US
1371UT
1371UU
1371UV
1371UW
1371UX
1371UY
1371UZ
1371VA
1371VB
1371VC
1371VD
1371VE
1371VF
1371VG
1371VH
1371VI
1371VJ
1371VK
1371VL
1371VM
1371VN
1371VO
1371VP
1371VQ
1371VR
1371VS
1371VT
1371VU
1371VV
1371VW
1371VX
1371VY
1371VZ
1371WA
1371WB
1371WC
1371WD
1371WE
1371WF
1371WG
1371WH
1371WI
1371WJ
1371WK
1371WL
1371WM
1371WN
1371WO
1371WP
1371WQ
1371WR
1371WS
1371WT
1371WU
1371WV
1371WW
1371WX
1371WY
1371WZ
1371XA
1371XB
1371XC
1371XD
1371XE
1371XF
1371XG
1371XH
1371XI
1371XJ
1371XK
1371XL
1371XM
1371XN
1371XO
1371XP
1371XQ
1371XR
1371XS
1371XT
1371XU
1371XV
1371XW
1371XX
1371XY
1371XZ
1371YA
1371YB
1371YC
1371YD
1371YE
1371YF
1371YG
1371YH
1371YI
1371YJ
1371YK
1371YL
1371YM
1371YN
1371YO
1371YP
1371YQ
1371YR
1371YS
1371YT
1371YU
1371YV
1371YW
1371YX
1371YY
1371YZ
1371ZA
1371ZB
1371ZC
1371ZD
1371ZE
1371ZF
1371ZG
1371ZH
1371ZI
1371ZJ
1371ZK
1371ZL
1371ZM
1371ZN
1371ZO
1371ZP
1371ZQ
1371ZR
1371ZS
1371ZT
1371ZU
1371ZV
1371ZW
1371ZX
1371ZY
1371ZZ



245
RELIABILITY OF GROUND TRUTHING
MOUNTAIN-PINE-BEETLE-KILLED PONDEROSA PINE
AFTER BEETLE EMERGENCE //

BY

JAMES W. ALLEN
Forester, Black Hills National Forest
and
WILLIAM B. WHITE
Group Leader, Entomology

TECHNICAL REPORT R2-23

AUGUST 1981

Forest Pest Management
State and Private Forestry
Rocky Mountain Region
USDA Forest Service
11177 W. 8th Avenue
Lakewood, Colorado 80225

INTRODUCTION

In the western United States, bark beetles cause more tree mortality than any other insect group or any disease. In Colorado, mountain pine beetle (MPB) infestations have been highly visible and of general public concern since 1972 (Lister, 1980).

In 1979, a pilot test was undertaken to assess the usefulness of panoramic aerial photography to estimate the annual mortality of ponderosa pine by the MPB in Colorado (Dillman et al., 1980). This survey included the Colorado Front Range from Denver southward to the New Mexico state line. The success and accuracy achieved with the 1979 pilot test led to an operational survey in 1980 of the entire Colorado Front Range from Wyoming to New Mexico, using the same techniques as the 1979 survey (Dillman et al., 1981). The 1979 pilot survey was designed primarily to test the accuracy of the photo interpretation in assessing ponderosa pine mortality. The ground truth of the photography was assumed to be completely accurate.

During the planning stages for the 1980 project, some questions were raised as to the accuracy of the ground truth; that is, were the trees that were classified as new faders (trees attacked by MPB the previous year) really new faders? The reason for questioning fader classification follows: When the ground truth is conducted (September through October), the insect has already abandoned the tree. Fader classification is accomplished by backdating, using combinations of the following characteristics: Needle retention, needle color, amount and freshness of frass in bark cracks and at base of tree, freshness of pitch tubes on tree, dryness of wood beneath bark, looseness of bark, and appearance or absence of fungi and mold along phloem layer. All of these can vary from site to site and year to year, depending on various environmental factors.

Misidentification of the year of tree-fading had the potential to be a significant error factor in a survey where ground truthing for faders occurred after beetle flight. To answer this concern, an assumption was made that if treefading plots were visited at the same time as ground-truth plots for the loss assessment evaluation were visited and techniques of identification were the same, then a comparison of results from the tree fading should be appropriate.

Naturally, the best method for identifying current faders is to check trees before insect flight for the presence of live insects. To date, a survey has not been designed that offers this option.

OBJECTIVE

The objective of the tree fading study was to determine if the crews in the field conducting the ground truth were accurately identifying the year of fading for ponderosa pine.

METHODS

A total of 27 tree-fading plots were established throughout the Front Range¹. The Front Range of Colorado is approximately 12 million acres and includes portions of Pike, San Isabel, Arapaho, Roosevelt, and Rio Grande National Forests. Excluding the North Park area and San Luis Valley, this area includes the Rocky Mountains east of the Continental Divide from the Wyoming state line southward to the New Mexico state line on the south. Each plot contained a group of trees killed by mountain pine beetles (1980 faders). Plots averaged 2 acres in size and had current-year fader counts ranging from 8 to 108 (Table 1). These plots were established during July and August before beetle emergence. All dead trees were checked for MPB, then blazed and numbered. If MPB were present, the tree was recorded as a new fader. All other numbered trees were recorded as old faders.

These plots were again visited during the ground-truth phase of the operational loss assessment evaluation titled "Panoramic Aerial Photography for Estimating Annual Mortality of Ponderosa Pine Caused by Mountain Pine Beetle" (Dillman et al., 1981). This time crews recorded trees as either old or new faders based on accepted techniques. Because of wood cutting activities on 5 plots, only 22 of the 27 plots remained in October.

The results of this study are based upon the following statistics:

Let D denote the difference between the actual number of new faders and the number of new faders counted at the ground truth visit for plot i ; then the mean difference (\bar{D}) and its standard error (S_D) can be estimated by:

^{1/}

Locations for the 27 fader plots are on file at the Region 2 Forest Pest Management office, 11177 W. 8th Avenue, Lakewood, Colorado 80225.

$$\bar{D} = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^m D_i}{m}$$

$$s_D = \frac{s_D}{\sqrt{m}}$$

where

$$s_D = \frac{\sqrt{\sum_{i=1}^m (D_i - \bar{D})^2}}{\sqrt{m - 1}}$$

The statistical significance of the mean difference (μ_D) can be tested using t-statistic with (m-1) degrees of freedom.

$$t = \bar{D}/s_D$$

The null hypothesis that $\mu_D = 0$ is accepted if $t < t_c$, where t_c is the critical value of t at 5 percent probability level and (m-1) degrees of freedom. The null hypothesis is rejected if $t > t_c$.

RESULTS

The results of the test of significance (Table 1) indicate that there was no evidence to reject the null hypothesis that $\mu_D = 0$. This means that the field crews identified new faders after beetle emergence with no significant bias.

CONCLUSIONS

If the results from the tree-fading study are applicable to the ground truth data set for the loss assessment evaluation, then, collecting field data on ponderosa pine tree fading after beetle emergence is not a critical bias factor as previously believed. Based on this assumption, loss assessment surveys need not develop correction factors relative to ground-truthing the faders after beetle emergence. However, efforts must be made to eliminate errors that existed; better training of field crews will help.

Table 1. Data for the Test of Reliability of Ground-Truth Counts*

Plot #	Number of New Faders		Difference D_i
	Actual	Counted at Ground Truth	
1	10	18	-8
2	21	23	-2
3	15	15	0
4	14	14	0
5	25	27	-2
6	24	26	-2
7	38	37	1
8	20	35	-15
9	14	15	-1
10	29	33	-4
11	51	49	2
12	22	26	-4
13	108	128	-20
14	37	45	-8
15	8	7	1
16	27	8	8
17	63	62	1
18	16	17	-1
19	24	24	0
20	55	54	1
21	24	29	-5
22	96	105	-9

* $t < t_c$: null hypothesis accepted.

$$\begin{aligned}
 \bar{D} &= -2.59 \\
 s_D &= 7.2 \\
 s_D &= 1.54 \\
 t &= -1.68 \\
 t_c (21, 0.05) &= 2.08
 \end{aligned}$$

